Article Title: A Scandal in Niobrara: The Controversial Career of Rev Samuel D Hinman

Full Citation: Anne Beiser Allen, "A Scandal in Niobrara: The Controversial Career of Rev Samuel D Hinman," *Nebraska History* 90 (2009): 114-129

Date: 10/14/2011

Article Summary: The Reverend Samuel Dutton Hinman served for seventeen years as an Episcopal missionary, government translator and advocate for the Dakota. In 1878 his superior dismissed him in disgrace because of persistent rumors of impropriety. The author suggests that Hinman’s reputation as an “Indian lover” may have been responsible for the rumors.

Cataloging Information:

Names: Samuel Dutton Hinman, William Henry Hare, Henry B Whipple, Mary Bury Hinman, John Williamson, Robert Clarkson, Alexander Faribault, Henry H Sibley, Taopi, William Welsh, Mary Myrick Hinman

Place Names: Lower Sioux reservation (Minnesota River), Minnesota; Crow Creek (Missouri River), Dakota Territory; Santee reservation, Niobrara, Nebraska; Birch Coulee, Morton, Minnesota

Keywords: Samuel Dutton Hinman, Santee Sioux, Dakota, William Henry Hare, Henry B Whipple, Niobrara, Mary Bury Hinman; American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions, John Williamson, Episcopal Board of Missions, Peace Commission (1868), Robert Clarkson, Peace Policy, Mary Myrick Hinman, William Welsh

Photographs / Images: Rev Samuel D Hinman; map of places where Hinman served among the Santee Sioux; confirmation of Sioux at Fort Snelling, Minnesota, by Bishop Whipple; Crow Creek Agency on the Missouri River in Dakota Territory; Crow Creek Chapel; Mary Bury Hinman, first wife of Samuel Hinman; Santee Indian mission near Niobrara, Nebraska; Bishop William Hare; Indian converts with Euro-American clothing and hair styles; St Mary’s Episcopal Mission, Santee Agency, Nebraska; Santee Agency; Dakota members of St Cornelia’s Church near Morton, Minnesota, with Bishop Whipple
A Scandal in Niobrara: The Controversial Career of Rev. Samuel D. Hinman

By Anne Beiser Allen

In March 1878, the Rev. Samuel Dutton Hinman, founder and long-time head of the Episcopal Church's mission to the Santee Sioux at Niobrara, was abruptly dismissed from his post by his superior, Bishop William Henry Hare, who accused Hinman of a "cool calculating evil" that included lechery, intoxication and financial chicanery. Hinman denied the charges and eventually filed suit for libel after Bishop Hare published his charges in a booklet distributed among the mission's supporters in Philadelphia and New York.

The episode nearly ended Hinman's fifteen-year career as a missionary, government translator, and vocal advocate for the Dakota. Although the court found Hare's accusations unfounded, and Hinman returned to mission work in 1884 under Minnesota's Bishop Henry B. Whipple, Hare continued to insist that Hinman was guilty as charged. On his deathbed in 1909, Hare told his son, "If I had been an older man, I suppose I should have done it differently; but it was my duty, and I am glad I did it!"

Was Samuel Hinman a scoundrel, as Bishop Hare believed? Or was he falsely accused by a man who was jealous of his achievements, and who disagreed with him about the direction of the mission's work among the Dakotas?
Born in Pennsylvania in 1839, Samuel Hinman was orphaned at a young age and educated by an uncle at an Episcopal academy in Connecticut. Inspired by the reports of missionaries working among Native Americans on the frontier, he enrolled in 1858 as one of the first students at Seabury Theological School in Faribault, Minnesota. As part of his training, Hinman taught Ojibwe children at Andrews Hall, a mission school associated with Seabury. He also became acquainted with Dakota families who came to visit the town's founder, former Indian trader Alexander Faribault, whose mother was Dakota.

In June 1860, Minnesota's newly elected Episcopal bishop, Henry B. Whipple, visited the Dakota reservation, a narrow strip of land on the upper reaches of the Minnesota River that the tribe had retained following their 1851 sale of southern Minnesota to the U.S. Several chiefs of the Mde-wakanton band met with him, asking him to send them a missionary to set up a school at the Lower Agency. Whipple immediately thought of Hinman.

Following his graduation from Seabury in September 1860, Hinman was ordained as a deacon and began his service among the Dakota at the Lower Sioux reservation on the Minnesota River. Following the 1862 Dakota war, he accompanied the exiled Dakota to their new reservation on Crow Creek on the Missouri River in Dakota Territory. After three years of suffering, the Dakota were relocated to the Santee reservation near Niobrara, Nebraska. In 1872, Hinman's mission was put under the supervision of the new Missionary Bishop of Niobrara, William H. Hare, who established his headquarters in Yankton. Following his dismissal from the mission in 1878, Hinman was hired in 1884 by Minnesota Bishop Henry B. Whipple to work with the Dakota who had returned to Minnesota and established a settlement near Morton, not far from their old reservation.
in the church and married Mary Bury, one of the teachers at Andrews Hall. The young couple, with Emily West, another teacher from Andrews, proceeded to the Lower Agency where they founded a mission named for St. John the Evangelist. Hinman built a wood frame mission house where they could live, teach and hold services.

The new missionary was determined to learn the Dakota language, so that he would not be dependent on interpreters to help him preach the Gospel. He spent a great deal of time with the men and women who came to his services, even accompanied a group of Dakota on a hunt. As soon as he felt fluent enough, he began to translate services from the Episcopal Book of Common Prayer into Dakota, using the writing system created by the Congregationalist missionary Samuel Pond. The mission grew steadily. In January 1861, Hinman wrote his bishop that 150 Dakota had attended his Christmas services. Most of them were children from his school, but by mid-1862, he had converted several Dakota men, including the minor chiefs Taopi and Good Thunder.

In the summer of 1862, Hinman's congregation laid the foundations for a stone church. It was still unfinished when the Dakota War broke out in August. The Dakotas—frustrated by the government's tardiness in living up to the commitments made in the 1851 treaty, and its efforts to get them to give up their traditional way of life—attacked white farmsteads, the soldiers at Fort Ridgely, and the town of New Ulm. Warned by one of their converts, the Episcopal missionaries fled to safety at the fort. A hastily recruited army under Col. Henry H. Sibley defeated the Dakota at Wood Lake in October, taking more than 1,800 captives and releasing 269 people who had been held prisoner by the Dakota. Hinman did not abandon his converts. After the Dakotas surrendered, nearly 1,500 of them—mostly women, children and old men—were marched to Fort Snelling, outside the state's capital at St. Paul. They were placed in a camp for the winter, while the warriors were tried in Mankato for war crimes. Hinman spent the winter in the camp. His flock increased significantly in the aftermath of the tribe's defeat, as the disillusioned Dakota sought to distance themselves from those tribal elements whose actions had led to the war.

By the middle of March 1863, Hinman's congregation numbered 300, forty-seven of whom were confirmed by Bishop Whipple. Missionaries from the Catholic Church and the American Board of
Commissioners for Foreign Missions were equally successful. All three missions sent representatives to the prisoners at Davenport, where they also made converts.¹⁰

The state’s white community, still in a state of uproar over the atrocities reportedly committed by the Dakota during the war, objected vociferously to the missionaries’ efforts. A local newspaper headlined its report of the confirmation of 108 Episcopal Dakota in April “Awful Sacrilege: Holiest Rites of Religion Given to Murderers.” One evening, Hinman was attacked by ruffians outside the camp and knocked unconscious by a slingshot.¹¹

In early May, the 1,318 Dakota who had survived the harsh winter in the camp were loaded onto two steamboats and sent to a new camp at Crow Creek, a desolate stretch of prairie on the Missouri River in Dakota Territory. Hinman (who had been ordained to the priesthood in March) and American Board missionary John Williamson accompanied them.¹²

The next two years were a form of purgatory, as the Dakota battled drought, sickness and inferior-quality government rations sent overland from St. Paul, Minnesota. Nearly 300, mostly children, died the first year. Outraged, Hinman wrote to Bishop Whipple, “If I were an Indian, I would never lay down the war-club while I lived!” But he judged the prospects for mission work in the region as excellent: he estimated there were 10,000 Indians living on the Great Plains, most of whom spoke a form of Dakota, and added, “This is as central a spot as any . . . we must make the best of it.”¹³

Assisted by native lay leaders, Hinman ministered to his flock in a combined chapel and mission house built of cottonwood. As early as 1864, reports of his work began to appear in The Spirit of Missions, the Episcopal Board of Missions’ official publication, primarily in letters written by bishops Whipple of Minnesota and Robert Clarkson of Nebraska. A thin but steady stream of donations from Eastern philanthropists and parish mission societies began to flow to the mission.

There was friction between the Episcopal and American Board missions, a natural result of two competing versions of Christianity being offered to a population of less than 1,400.¹⁴ The American Board had begun work among Minnesota’s Dakota in the 1830s. They had some modest success among the Sisseton and Wahpeton bands at the Upper Agency before the Dakota War, and were preparing to open a mission at the Lower Sioux Agency when Hinman began his work there. Inevitably, the American Board regarded the Episcopalians as poachers in their territory.¹⁵

The differences between the two missions were both theological (a communal, liturgy-centered form of worship versus a personal, homiletic one) and political, with Hinman supporting the old chiefs and Williamson advocating an elected leadership.¹⁶ Both missionaries held services and taught their schools
in the Dakota language, which official government policy considered a "barbarous dialect . . . [that] should be blotted out." At the same time, they conformed to government policy by insisting that their converts adopt Euro-American clothing and hair styles, live in houses made of logs or framed wood rather than tipis or wigwams, and become farmers, carpenters, and blacksmiths instead of hunters.

On a fund-raising trip to Philadelphia in 1864, Hinman met William Welsh, a wealthy Episcopal philanthropist. Welsh helped him to establish a connection with the Quaker community, which had a longstanding interest in missionary work among Indians. Because the Episcopal Board of Missions had not yet taken a formal position on the Dakota mission, Hinman's financial support came from Bishop Whipple's diocesan missionary fund, supplemented by small private donations. Welsh became one of Hinman's chief supporters, both financially and politically.18

In 1865, Hinman visited Washington with a delegation of Dakota who had protected white people during the Dakota War and helped track down the escaped warriors afterwards. For their efforts, these "friendly Siouxs" had been allowed to remain in Minnesota after the reservation was closed, and had been promised a reward in land and money. Preoccupied by the Civil War, the government had failed to follow up on its promises, and these men and their families were living on the charity of former fur traders Alexander Faribault and General Henry H. Sibley. Following the visit of the Dakota delegation, Congress set aside 10,000 acres in Minnesota for their use. But the antipathy of the local populace kept the land from being allotted, and it was soon returned to the open market. The "friendly Siouxs" received only $7,500, to be divided among thirty-six men.19

During the Dakotas' three years at Crow Creek, Hinman's wife remained in Minnesota. Unlike John Williamson, who had assistants at his mission from among his co-religionists, Hinman lived alone among the Santee, relying on native converts to help him with the mission's work. His fondness for the Dakota, and his willingness to overlook some of their traditions—such as placing food on the graves of the dead—were regarded by many of his white colleagues as suspect. This attitude spread to the Dakota as well. When the question of whether or not to allow dancing arose at a convocation between Hinman and his native clergy in 1869, it was the Indians, not Hinman, who opposed the practice.20

Hinman's solitary status and fondness for the Dakota sparked rumors in Faribault in 1865 that he was having immoral relations with Dakota women at his mission. Bishop Whipple promptly investigated the charges, found them untrue, and announced the results of his investigation publicly before a group of forty citizens of the town. Spreading tales of sexual immorality by white men who were sympathetic towards Indians was common in the West at that time. Unfortunately, despite Bishop Whipple's exoneration of Hinman and the staunch support of Hinman's wife Mary Bury Hinman, the rumors refused to die out.21

One point on which Hinman and John Williamson agreed was that the Crow Creek site was unacceptable as a reservation. Despite the government's insistence that things would improve with time, the land was poor and game was scarce. The missionaries began lobbying through their allies in Washington for a more satisfactory site. After three years of high mortality rates caused by drought and grasshopper invasions, Congress agreed in 1866 to move the Dakota to a more propitious location. Hinman persuaded the chiefs to refuse the first site suggested, in Dakota Territory between the James and Big Sioux Rivers. Instead, a reservation for the tribe—now known as the Santee Sioux—was set up in northeast Nebraska at the juncture of the Niobrara and Missouri rivers. However, there was no guarantee that they would be allowed to remain there permanently.22
The “friendly Sioux,” who had remained in Minnesota, remained a source of embarrassment to the government. The small grant they received in 1865 was long gone, and they were still living in poverty, while their “unfriendly” relatives were receiving regular annuity payments on the reservation. In 1868, the government asked Hinman to gather the “friendly Sioux” and bring them to Niobrara. Some of them, fearing reprisals from their fellow tribesmen for their actions during the Dakota War, were unwilling to move. The government agreed to let them stay behind, but refused to pay annuities to anyone not living on the reservation.

The plight of one of these men, Taopi, who died the following February in extreme poverty, moved William Welsh to prepare a pamphlet entitled The Journal of the Reverend S. D. Hinman, Missionary to the Santee Sioux Indians, and Taopi (later subtitled Taopi and His Friends). The book included an extract from Hinman’s diary for the month of January 1869 and a copy of the address made by Bishop Whipple at Taopi’s funeral. There were also copies of letters from Hinman, former Minnesota Superintendent of Indian Affairs W. J. Cullen, Minnesota’s ex-Senator Henry M. Rice, and former Dakota agent Joseph R. Brown, as well as the report of the Peace Commission of 1868.

As a piece of propaganda for those who believed that Indian unrest in the American West was caused by the failure of the government to keep the promises made in its treaties over the years, the book was a tremendous success. It was reprinted several times and circulated widely among those East Coast philanthropists who were now calling themselves Friends of the Indian. Samuel Hinman acquired a nationwide reputation as Christ’s vicar among the Dakota.

Because of Hinman’s fluency in the Dakota language, he was appointed interpreter to the Peace Commission led by General William T. Sherman in 1868. The commission’s purpose was to negotiate with the Plains tribes following Red Cloud’s war, and the resulting treaty was a landmark in the government’s relations with the Lakota, the Cheyenne, and their allied tribes. Hinman accompanied the Santee delegation to Fort Laramie and signed the resulting treaty as a witness. He is said to be the author of Article 6, which guaranteed the permanent status of the Santee reservation at Niobrara, allowing the Dakota to acquire title to their land and to become American citizens within three years.23

The move to Niobrara brought Hinman’s mission into a new Episcopal diocese, and in 1866 Hinman was officially transferred from Whipple’s jurisdiction to that of Nebraska’s Missionary Bishop Robert Clarkson. Hinman’s wife, with their two young sons and Emily West, moved to Sioux City that year. Following the 1868 treaty, Hinman began constructing a substantial mission complex that by 1870 consisted of a stone church building, a school, a mission house and a hospital. Mary Hinman, Emily West and another former teacher from the Faribault Indian School, Mary J. Leigh, joined the Indian lay leaders at Niobrara as the mission’s core staff.

Bishop Clarkson visited Hinman’s mission that year and reported that Hinman was “managing the temporal affairs of the mission with care and prudence.” The mission had over 250 communicants out of an estimated total population of 1,000 Santee, and was establishing a second, native-led mission upstream at Yankton. Bishop Clarkson ordained Paul Mazekute, one of Hinman’s earliest converts, as a deacon, and three other Santee men were sent to the church’s Mission House in Philadelphia to study for the priesthood.24

Soon after Ulysses S. Grant became president, the nation’s Indian policy underwent a major overhaul. Hoping to end the endemic fraud that racked the Indian Service, Grant replaced all his predecessor’s Indian agents, first with army officers and then, at the urging of friends among the Quakers, with men chosen by the nation’s churches. Although this Peace Policy, as it was called, failed to bring peace between the Indians and the white set-

Santee Indian mission near Niobrara, Nebraska. By 1870 the complex consisted of a stone church building, a school, a mission house and a hospital. NSHS RG2053:24-3
tlers, it was a great boon to the Christian missions, who now had government support for their work on the reservations.

The Santee reservation was among those assigned to the Episcopal Church. Soon after that happened, derogatory rumors about Hinman’s character again began to circulate. Hinman attributed them to “a foolish fellow who thought I wanted to be an Indian agent.” Complaints were made to William Welsh, who was now chair of the government’s Indian Commission, and to Bishop Clarkson, but both men continued to support Hinman, and the rumors died down. By the end of April 1869, Hinman was able to write to his friend Bishop Whipple that “all active in the matter most humbly sought my forgiveness.”

The new Santee agent, selected by the Episcopal Church under Welsh’s guidance, was a Quaker, Asa Janney. It is possible that this decision reflected a desire to prevent any suggestion of favoritism between the Episcopal and American Board missions. John Williamson had left Niobrara in 1869 for Yankton, and was succeeded by Alfred Riggs, whose father like Williamson’s had been an early missionary to the Dakota. Riggs was even more prickly than his predecessor, and rivalry between the two missions intensified. In November 1871, William Welsh observed that “the Riggs family seemed to be possessed, therefore they bedeviled [Jared] Daniels [an Episcopalian named government agent to the Sisseton and Wahpeton in 1869], Hinman and our Ponca agent.”

In accordance with the new government policy, the Episcopal Board of Missions in 1870 established a Commission for Indian Missions, headed by William Welsh. At Welsh’s insistence, Hinman’s mission was brought under the umbrella of the national church’s missionary program. About the same time, a tornado struck the Samee mission, destroying many of the buildings, injuring both Hinman and his wife and killing two men. The fund-raising effort involved in rebuilding the mission, coming at a time when the mission’s finances were being transferred to the church’s Indian Commission, resulted in a degree of confusion in the records and raised questions as to Hinman’s fiscal responsibility. Critics suggested Hinman might have used mission funds to cover personal expenses. In 1873, bishops Whipple, Clarkson, and William H. Hare carefully reviewed the mission’s books, and declared Hinman innocent of any financial impropriety.

William Hare had been consecrated as missionary bishop of Niobrara, with responsibility for all Indian missions east of the Rocky Mountains, by the church’s General Convention in October 1872. Born in Philadelphia in 1838 to a prominent church family, he was nine years older than Hinman and had served for several years as the Board of Missions’ general secretary for foreign missions. Bishop Whipple himself proposed Hare for the new Episcopal position. Pleased by this choice, Hinman wrote Welsh, “There is no nobler man in the American church. I wish him every blessing.” Hare’s extensive clerical connections, expertise in fund-raising, and unquestioned social skills were decided assets for the cause of Indian mission work.

Hinman and Bishop Hare got along well at first. Hare was impressed by Hinman’s success in spreading the gospel, originally through the efforts of native preachers, to the Yankton, Yanktonais, Upper and Lower Brule, Spotted Tail, Red Cloud, Cheyenne River, and Ponca reservations. His first annual report in September 1873 praised Hinman’s accomplishments. However, Mary Hinman observed in a letter to her husband that she had told a
friend "that we had the highest respect for Bishop H and believed him to be our friend, but that he seemed to listen to all those stories and apparently credited them." The old tales of Hinman's improper behavior continued to circulate.

Meanwhile, Hinman's reputation as an Indian specialist continued to grow. In 1873, he served with John Williamson and Jared Daniels on a commission to secure from the Indians transit rights through the Yellowstone Valley for the Northern Pacific Railroad. In 1874, he accompanied another commission to the Black Hills to select a site for an agency to serve the Red Cloud and Spotted Tail bands. In his report on this journey, he tried to play down the mineral potential of the area, which Lt. Col. George A. Custer was describing as considerable, especially with regard to gold. Unfortunately, Custer's report was more accurate, and the Black Hills were soon swarming with prospectors. In 1875, Hinman was named chief translator for negotiations with the Lakota for the sale of the Black Hills. He served in the same capacity in 1876, when the sale was pushed through in defiance of the terms of the 1868 treaties.2

In March 1876, Mary Bury Hinman, who had never completely recovered from her injuries in the 1870 tornado, died following a long battle with a throat disorder.3 She had been her husband's right hand throughout most of his ministry, tactfully smoothing over the edges of his enthusiasms and deflecting the persistent rumors of his sexual misconduct by her staunch loyalty. The Santee held her in great respect; the Santee Episcopal chapel at Flandreau, South Dakota, was named St. Mary's in her honor.

After Mary's death, the rumors of Hinman's "abandoned character" resumed with a vengeance. He was accused of drunkenness, making improper advances toward young Indian women, and misusing mission funds. Bishop Hare, who had spent the last year in Europe due to ill health, heard the tales upon his return and became alarmed. However, he continued to treat Hinman with respect, appointing him to the diocesan post of dean, with responsibility over both the Santee and Spotted Tail reservation missions.4

In October 1877, Hinman attended the church's General Convention as an official delegate of the Niobrara district. While there, he was shocked to learn that his bishop was spreading derogatory rumors behind his back.5

It was the practice of the Board of Missions to review each missionary's record annually, before renewing his appointment. The following March, Hinman was informed that the Board had declined to reappoint him as head of the Santee mission. Bishop Hare later claimed that the native clergy had asked him to remove Hinman because of the latter's bad character. He ordered Hinman to leave the mission forthwith, and even enlisted the help of the government agent to force Hinman off the reservation.6

Hinman demanded a clerical trial, before a court made up of his fellow diocesan priests, and one was duly scheduled for June 1878. Postponed for a month, the trial eventually found Hinman guilty, but he was not disciplined or struck from the clerical rolls. One receives the impression of a court responding unwillingly, and under a certain amount of duress. Bishop Whipple later wrote to Bishop Hare, "I have felt very grave doubts as to the verdict of the court. Mr. Cook [the Episcopal missionary at Yankton] wrote me after a full conversation with all of the court that they had found Mr. Hinman innocent. Their verdict of guilty, I was told, was not made for weeks after the close of the trial."7

Hinman's subsequent appeal to the Board of Missions was rejected. They could not, they said, overrule a missionary bishop on personnel matters. When the letter containing Hinman's request was published as a pamphlet, Hare retaliated with a pamphlet of his own, entitled, "The Rehearsal of the Facts." Hare's "facts" were certainly damning: Hinman was accused of public drunkenness, financial improprieties, and making sexual advances to both native and white women at the mission.8

Unfortunately, many of Hare's witnesses were no longer able to affirm that they had been quoted accurately. Hinman's longtime supporter William Welsh—who according to Hare had called Hinman "a man of abandoned character" who infected his wife with syphilis—had died in January 1878. The native priest Daniel Hemans, who Hare said had assured him that "the Christian people among the Santees believe the reports [of Hinman's immoral behavior] to be true," died of tuberculosis on March 31, 1878. Clara Kerbach, the German matron of St. Mary's Girls' School on the Santee reservation, gave Hare a written statement describing Hinman's alleged attempt to seduce her, but returned to Germany that year and could not be traced. Dakota clergymen Luke Walker and Amos Ross, who also corroborated Hare's assertions, later admitted they were only repeating second-hand information. Ross said they had hoped Hare would show his gratitude by replacing Hinman at the Santee mission with Daniel Hemans, who was one of their own people.9
Missionaries pressured converts to adopt Euro-American clothing and hair styles, and to abandon tipis and wigwams for houses made of logs or framed wood. Santee Agency, Nebraska. NSHS RG2063:23-62

When he saw Hare’s pamphlet, Hinman sued his bishop for libel in the state of New York, where the national church had its headquarters. Item by item, Hinman refuted all the charges. He was especially outraged by the allegation that his wife had died of syphilis. She had never consulted the doctor whom Hare cited, Hinman declared; the man was a distant relative of hers whom she disliked intensely. As for Miss Kerbach’s allegations, Hinman claimed it was she who had made overtures to him, coming into his bedroom in her nightgown one night while he was sleeping. He had cried out and his sister, who was also living in the house at the time, had come to investigate, at which point Miss Kerbach retreated. As for the accusation that he had misused mission funds, Hinman pointed out that Hare himself had served on the commission that had affirmed Hinman’s innocence back in 1873.30

Why did Hare find it so easy to believe these outrageous charges against his most prominent missionary? To begin with, the two men were quite different in character and background. Hinman was a strong, energetic, outgoing man, fond of long walks, who had hunted with the Dakota in order to learn their language, slept in a tent at the Fort Snelling concentration camp, and endured the three years’ privation at Crow Creek. Hare was conscientious and diligent, but preferred to make his home among his own people in the relative comfort of the territorial capital at Yankton. He constantly worried about his health; in 1874, he told Bishop Whipple that the climate of the Dakotas was aggravating an “organic condition” of his heart, and he took several trips to Europe for rest and treatment.

Hinman expressed his passion for his work in exuberant hyperbole, writing to William Welsh in 1869 that “we have had a glorious Christmas,” and describing the extension of farming at Santee in 1870 as “the death-blow to heathenism, barbarism and idleness, and therefore, a medicine absolutely necessary to restore health and quicken life.”31 Hare’s reports are more prosaic, usually describing lists of accomplishments, and betray a more reserved mind-set. His attitude toward native culture...
adhered to accepted norms; in 1873 he wrote, "The Indian problem... will find its solution, under the favor of GOD, in the faithful execution of the powers committed by GOD to the Civil Government, and a common-sense administration of the gracious gifts deposited with His Church." 69

Perhaps none of this would have mattered had Hare not believed Hinman had coveted the bishopric for himself in 1872. Despite his insistence that he had no ambitions in that direction, Hinman never forgot that he was "the founder of all the missions to the Dakotas, that they were built by years of patient and lonely toil and that but for me—I speak as a man—they would not have been." 69 It is likely that he never let Hare forget it either.

Hare seems to have been dismayed by the wide respect Hinman commanded among his fellow missionaries, which showed clearly during the 1878 clerical trial, when the court refused to follow its bishop's wishes and order Hinman dismissed from the priesthood. Many members of Hinman's Santee congregation also supported him. Napoleon Wabasha, a chief at the Santee mission and a lay leader in the church, wrote to the Board of Missions in 1879, protesting Hinman's dismissal; the letter was signed by forty men of the tribal council. 64 The attachment of the Santee flock to their spiritual shepherd was so strong that Bishop Hare had to order them not to have further contact with Hinman. If they did, he told them their rations would be withheld by the government agency. 64

In Hinman's mind, the chief problem was that he and Hare stood on opposite sides of the major theological dispute dividing the nineteenth-century Episcopal Church. Hare was an evangelical, a Low Churchman, who believed in the primacy of preaching and individual witness over liturgy. Hinman, on the other hand, reveled in the liturgical excesses of the High Church faction. In 1868, while he was still under Bishop Clarkson's oversight, Hinman apologized to his friend and mentor Bishop Whipple (also a High Churchman, but on a more moderate scale) for having dressed his Dakota choir boys in white surplices for the Christmas service. The "uniform" had been intended to beautify the seasonal service; it hadn't occurred to him that it would be seen as a partisan gesture, suggesting sympathy toward Roman Catholic practices. 65

Until Mary Bury Hinman's death in 1876, the rumors of Hinman's sexual immorality were fairly easily countered. For most of his time among the Santee, however, Hinman had been the only white male connected with his mission. Several female missionaries lived at the mission house and taught at its school, but only Clara Kerbach ever complained of Hinman's behavior toward them. 67 With his half-sister Ellen Barnes and the elderly Emily West in residence, as well as Hinman's young sons, it appears to have been a well-ordered and well-chaperoned establishment, even after Mary Bury Hinman died. 68

Santee Agency, Nebraska. NSHS RG2063:23-01
In 1884, Samuel D. Hinman married Mary Myrick, a Dakota woman. Mary's mother, Nancy Stone, had been married after the practices of her people to Andrew Myrick, an American trader who ran a post at the Lower Sioux Agency in Minnesota until his death in the Dakota War of 1862. Mary was eight months old when her father was murdered on the first day of the war. She spent the winter of 1862-63 in the prison camp at Fort Snelling, with her mother, her older sister, and her grandmother, Julia Stone. Mary had grown up on the reservation, among her mother's people, and was a member of Hinman's Santee mission. Shortly after the marriage, Hinman's New York lawyer described the new Mrs. Hinman as "very beautiful & her personal character & accomplishments seem to have impressed all whom I have heard here." It is tempting to see the relationship between the white missionary and the young Indian woman—Hinman was forty-seven, Mary twenty-two when they married—as a key element in Bishop Hare's disgust with his subordinate. After all, Hinman had been exonerated of most of the things he was accused of well before 1878. Would Bishop Hare have been so incensed if Hinman had chosen a white woman as his second wife? Did Hinman's fondness for Mary Myrick seem to give substance to the old rumors of his propensity for sexual dalliance with native women? Although Mary's name never appears in any of the court records, she seems to have hovered in the background, a shadowy figure personifying the racial prejudices of the time. Intermarriage between white men and native women was common, especially in the West, where eligible white women were rare. Traders especially often married Indian women to facilitate their business. But missionaries were expected to conform to a different standard. In his court testimony during the libel trial in 1880, the Dakota deacon Amos Ross claimed to have heard the rumors of Hinman's sexual improprieties from a man named Duncan Stone. Duncan may have been related to Mary Myrick's mother, Nancy Stone; if so, there may have been opposition to the relationship between Hinman and young Mary from her family as well as from his mission colleagues. The trial was over by the time Mary and Hinman were married, and their daughter, also named Mary, was not born until 1889.

When Samuel Hinman first began to court Mary Myrick is not known. She was sixteen when he was dismissed from the mission. As a widower with six young sons, Hinman would very likely have wanted to marry again, and Mary's youth would have been an asset in the hard life of a frontier mission. The fact that her name was not publicly linked with his until her marriage six years later may reflect the chivalric ethos of the nineteenth century, where a woman's reputation was not to be openly challenged without clear cause. It seems unlikely, however, that they would have begun a courtship after he left the mission, given the nature of the accusations that had been made against him.

In April 1882, the jury in the libel case found for the defendant, Hare, apparently on the grounds that while the accusations might not have been true, the bishop had believed them and had published his pamphlet in good faith. Hare was awarded $10,000. Hinman promptly appealed, and in June 1882 the court reversed its decision and awarded Hinman $11,774. Refusing to accept the new verdict, Hare demanded another trial. The issue dragged on until 1887, when the court ordered the litigants to seek arbitration from "mutual friends" in the church hierarchy. Hinman then signed a statement that he was satisfied that the bishop, though mistaken, sincerely believed the charges, and Hare agreed to give Hinman a letter dismissing him, formally transferring him as a priest in good standing to Bishop Whipple's diocese.

Hinman had been in a professional limbo for nearly a decade. In the Episcopal Church, a priest cannot perform his clerical duties (presiding at services, performing marriages and funerals, etc.) without permission from his bishop. Although Hinman had not been removed from the district's list of clergy "in regular standing" by the 1878 trial, Hare had refused to assign him any ministerial work. Without his stipend from the Board of Missions, he had few financial resources, and Hare and his supporters exerted their influence to prevent his being hired in any capacity by the government's Indian Bureau.

During the early stages of Hinman's dispute with his bishop, Hinman and his sons lived with seventy-year-old Emily West on a homestead she had claimed in Nebraska. In 1880, the Bureau of the Census hired him as an enumerator for the Sioux, and from 1882 to 1885 he collected Indian lore for the Smithsonian Institution. Bishop Whipple, although torn by his friendship with both parties in the dispute, and Hinman's other friends sent monetary gifts as they were able and helped to defray his legal expenses. In 1882, Newton Edmunds, former territorial governor of Dakota, hired Hinman as interpreter for a commission negotiating further land purchases from the Pine Ridge reservation.

It is tempting to see the relationship between the white missionary and the young Indian woman as a key element in Bishop Hare's disgust with his subordinate.
but Hinman resigned after he was accused of making threats and allowing boys as young as seven to sign the treaty document. Judge Peter Shannon, a member of Edmunds’ commission, told the New York Times that he “did not believe that [Hinman] had misrepresented anything to the Indians,” but the incident further damaged Hinman’s already weakened reputation. The government never used him as interpreter again.\(^5\)

During the early 1880s, a number of exiled Dakota returned to Minnesota, where they purchased land near their former homes. Good Thunder, one of Hinman’s early converts and a staunch Episcopalian, was one of them. He acquired a farm near the town of Morton, not far from the ruins of the old Lower Sioux Agency, and in June 1885 wrote to Bishop Whipple, offering to donate land for a church and asking the bishop to send a priest to serve there. Whipple would have liked to send Hinman, but he could not get Hare to agree to transfer him to the Minnesota diocese. Without that formal transfer, according to the laws of the Episcopal Church, Hinman could not officiate as a priest in another diocese.

Hare did not, however, object to Whipple’s hiring Hinman as a teacher. In 1886, Hinman and his family—including his new wife—moved to Good Thunder’s village. There he built a small mission house and a school that could be used as a chapel, with services led by Good Thunder and other licensed Dakota lay readers. “It is pleasant,” Hinman wrote to Whipple, “to be once more among friends.”\(^6\)

Over the next four years, Hinman worked with Bishop Whipple and others to get federal aid for the Dakota communities in Minnesota. Under the bishop’s direction, he tried to consolidate the various Dakota communities at Birch Coulee (as the Morton mission was then called), but he had little success. The bands at Prior Lake and Prairie Island insisted on staying where they were, although a small group from Faribault agreed to move.

In 1888, Hinman again found himself at the center of a controversy when he was accused of influencing the government agent assigned to distribute funds to the Minnesota Dakota, securing an overly large share for the Birch Coulee settlement. The agent denied the charges, which seem to
have arisen from bureaucratic delays and rivalries among the various Dakota communities.54

When Hare finally signed the letter dismissing Hinman from his diocese in October 1887, Hinman was restored to active ministry. Serving again under a bishop whom he loved and trusted, working among people who still respected him, he was re-energized. The Birch Coulee mission flourished under his guidance. In 1889, its members began to build a church, using stone recovered from the one abandoned, unfinished, after the Dakota War in 1862.

On March 24, 1890, Samuel Hinman died unexpectedly of pneumonia, at the age of 51. He was buried in an unmarked grave beside the new church, which today boasts a memorial window in his name. Shortly thereafter, Mary Myrick Hinman returned to her family on the Santee reservation in Nebraska, where she eventually remarried.59

**The notoriety caused by his**

dismissal from the mission brought an end to what had been an exceptional career for Hinman as a mediator between the Dakota and the U.S. government. It is impossible to tell whether he would have been able to resurrect his reputation once he moved back to Minnesota, where Bishop Whipple again took him under his protection.

Hinman had worked among the Dakota for seventeen years, laying the groundwork for the successful Episcopal missions which Bishop Hare would later be honored for fostering. For most of his adult life, Hinman lobbied diligently for the Dakota, in the field and occasionally even in Washington, D.C. He served as interpreter at numerous important councils with the Lakota. Whether he was guilty, as some said, of pressuring the Lakota to sign unfavorable treaties or whether those accusations, like the ones brought up during the trial, were fabricated by his enemies is impossible to tell at this date.

The persistence of negative rumors about Samuel Hinman can perhaps be attributed to the milieu in which he operated. While Hinman was highly respected by most of his flock, not all of the Dakota on the reservation were his friends. By supporting the traditional chiefs against those who wanted an elected leadership, he antagonized a significant segment of the tribe. His respect for the traditions of the Dakota (where they did not clearly contradict Christian theology) was unusual for a missionary of his time, and inspired criticism from both the religious and lay communities. While the American Board missionaries may not have been responsible for starting any of the rumors, they certainly believed them, as both John Williamson and Alfred Riggs testified at the libel trial. Unscrupulous traders would also have been happy to discredit a missionary who opposed the sale of liquor on the reservation.

Even his native clergy had ambivalent feelings about him. While Hinman had recruited them and encouraged them to prepare for the ministry, only the bishop would be able to ordain them as priests. It would be Bishop Hare who assigned them to specific missions. As Amos Ross testified at the trial, they had hoped he would give one of their own number charge of the influential Santee mission. Opposing the bishop would not be a good career move for them.

Each flare-up of rumors coincides to some degree with a time when Hinman came into the public eye. In 1865, he was urging Congress to make reparations to the “friendly Sioux,” an activity that was not popular with Minnesotans still recovering from the Dakota War. In 1868, he argued for the inclusion of a clause in the treaty with the Lakota that would guarantee the Santee reservation; many people apparently thought that he wanted the government agent’s post there. In 1873 (not long after the arrival of Bishop Hare in Dakota Territory), Hinman accompanied the commission appointed to treat with the Lakota for transit rights for the Northern Pacific Railroad. And in 1876, he served with the commission that arranged for the cession of the Black Hills. It was apparently no secret that he had originally attempted to keep knowledge of the presence of gold in the Black Hills from reaching the public.

He was, in short, well known as what the frontier community sneeringly called an “Indian lover.” He also tended to speak out energetically, almost recklessly, on behalf of his views regarding the nation’s Indian policy. With the encouragement of William Welsh, and using *The Spirit of Missions* as a platform, Hinman was able to share those views with a wide range of influential people. Is it any wonder that his detractors were eager to remove him from the scene? And how better than to accuse him of flagrant immoral behavior?

Although vindicated by the court, Hinman never completely succeeded in living down the damage done to his reputation by Bishop Hare’s published accusations. To this day, many historians regard Hinman as a somewhat seedy character. It is a sad epitaph for a man who devoted his life to serving a people whom he loved. ☼
N O T E S

1 William H. Hare to Bishop Henry B. Whipple, November 14, 1878, Henry B. Whipple Papers, Minnesota Historical Society (MHS).

2 M. A. D. Howe, The Life and Labors of Bishop Hare, Apostle to the Sioux (New York: Sturgis & Walton, 1911), 171.

3 George Tanner, Fifty Years of Church Work in the Diocese of Minnesota (St. Paul, 1909), 268-72.

4 Franklin Curtiss-Wedge, History of Redwood County (Chicago: H. C. Cooper & Co., 1916), vol. 2, 1067; oral history from Hinman’s daughter, Mary Hinman St. Croix, MHS; Tanner, 386-87; Henry B. Whipple diaries, vol. 2, Episcopal Church Records, MHS; Andrews Hall closed in 1862 during the Dakota War.

5 In 1860, the Dakota reservation in Minnesota stretched along the southwest bank of the Minnesota River from just below Redwood Falls to the Dakota border. It was one hundred miles long and about ten miles wide. An additional ten-mile-wide strip along the river’s northeast bank, which had been included in the original 1851 treaty, had been sold to the tribes by the U.S. government in 1858. There were two Indian agencies on the reservation, one where the Yellow Medicine River entered the Minnesota near Granite Falls, and another some twenty miles downstream near Redwood Falls. The Upper, or Yellow Medicine, Agency served the Sisseton and Wahpeton bands, while the Lower Sioux Agency served the Mdewakanton and Wahpekute. The American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Mission, a joint missionary effort of the Congregationalist and Presbyterian churches, had established missions near the Yellow Medicine agency in 1852, following several years of work among the Sisseton and Wahpeton at their former location near Minneapolis.

6 Betty P. and Edward L. Sherrard, The Mission at the Lower Sioux, 1860-1890 (Episcopal Diocese of Minnesota, 1981), 4-5. The Dakota Prayer Book, prepared by Hinman with the help of his Dakota converts, was published in 1865 and is still in use. Samuel Pond and his brother Gideon came to Minnesota in 1834 as independent missionaries to the Dakota; they later became affiliated with the American Board mission, which was established in 1835 under Thomas Williamson.

7 Samuel Hinman to Henry Whipple, January 6, 1862, Henry B. Whipple papers, Box 2, MHS; also Henry Whipple’s diary for 1862-63 (entry for July 2, 1862) in the Episcopal Church Diocesan Records, Box 42, MHS.

8 For a full description of the Dakota War’s inception and its aftermath, see Roy Meyer, History of the Santee Sioux (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1987).

9 Sibley’s military tribunal convicted 303 Dakota warriors of murder and sentenced them to death. President Lincoln reduced the total condemned to 38. Their hanging in Mankato, Minnesota, on December 26, 1862, was the largest mass execution ever held in the United States. The remainder of the convicted men were sent to a prison camp near Davenport, Iowa, where they remained for three years before rejoining their families at Niobrara. Many of the instigators of the war fled into Dakota Territory, where Sibley (who had been promoted to general) pursued them the following spring. With him went a number of Dakota scouts, many of whom had been acquitted in the trials.


11 Virginia Driving Hawk Sneve, That They May Have Life: The Episcopal Church in South Dakota, 1859-1976 (New York: Seabury Press, 1977), 19; Meyer, History of the Santee Sioux, 137-39; Mary St. Croix’s oral history. It is estimated that during the three years the Santee Dakota were at Crow Creek, more than 1,500 died.

12 The Crow Creek reservation, located on the east bank of the Missouri River, in south central South Dakota some fifty miles east of Pierre, is still active. After the Santee were relocated to Niobrara, the government used the Crow Creek establishment as a trading outpost for the Lower Brule and other Lakota bands. Some of the survivors of the Dakota war who fled the state in 1862 rather than surrender eventually settled there as well. John Williamson was the son of Dr. Thomas Williamson, who founded the American Board’s Dakota mission in 1835. The younger Williamson had intended to establish an American Board mission at the Lower Sioux Agency in 1860, when the Episcopal mission began there, but he had not yet done so.

13 Hinman to H. B. Whipple, June 26, 1863, Henry B. Whipple Papers, Box 2, MHS.

14 Report of the Commissioner of Indian Affairs, Department of the Interior, 1880, p. 120, says that 1,320 Santee arrived at Niobrara in 1866. By 1880 smallpox and the departure of some 400 for Flandreau, South Dakota, had reduced the number of residents at Niobrara to 864.

15 See transcript of Hinman v. Hare (copy in Hinman file, MHS), April 1882, testimony of Alfred Riggs.

16 Meyer, 168-69, 179; Sneve, 24.

17 Meyer, 189.

18 William Welsh was a wealthy Philadelphia merchant and an active layman in the Episcopal Church. He served as delegate to several General Convention gatherings in the 1860s and 1870s, and served on the Board of Missions. Becoming interested in Indian welfare through Bishop Whipple, Welsh was the first president of the government’s Board of Commissioners for Indian Affairs in 1869 (but resigned following a heated dispute with President Grant’s Commissioner of Indian Affairs, Ely Parker). He also facilitated the church’s mission to Cuba in the 1870s. See Anne Allen, And the Wilderness Shall Blossom: Henry Benjamin Whipple, Churchman, Educator, Advocate for the Indians (Afton, MN: Afton Historical Press, 2008).

19 Hinman to H. B. Whipple, June 1, 1866, Henry B. Whipple Papers, Box 4, MHS. See also “An Act for the Relief of Certain Friendly Indians of the Sioux Nation in Minnesota,” February 9, 1865, Whipple Papers, Box 4.

20 Extracts from Hinman’s journal, January 2 and 19, 1869, printed in the April 1869 edition of The Spirit of Missions.

21 Hinman v. Hare, 166, 176.

22 Meyer, 158-59, 167. The Niobrara site was chosen by BIA Superintendent Edward B. Taylor. Santee is a corruption of the word Sinte, meaning people of the lake, a term the Dakota sometimes used to describe themselves. The lake in question is Mille Lacs Lake in Minnesota, at one time a sacred site for the Dakota, although by the 1800s they had been driven from the area around it by the Ojibwe. Most of the Santee belong to the Mdewakanton subtribe, with some Wahpekute; the Sisseton and Wahpeton, who were less deeply involved in the Dakota War, moved voluntarily into Dakota Territory and eventually acquired their own reservation near Lake Traverse.

23 Doane Robinson, History of the Dakota or Sioux Indians (Minneapolis: Ross & Haines, 1904), 387; Sneve, 29.

24 The Spirit of Missions, January 1869, 3-6. A group of some 25 Santee families left the reservation in 1869 for Flandreau, South Dakota, where they purchased land; another 55 families joined them in 1870. Most of them were members of the American Board’s Presbyterian Church, but there were a number of Hinman’s Episcopalians among them, including Good Thunder, one of the chiefs who had approached Bishop Whipple to request a mission in 1860.
The only white male was Walter Hall, who lived at the mission from 1871-73 as a teacher and candidate for holy orders. Regarded by the family as an honorary aunt, Emily West lived with the Hinmans from 1869 until her death sometime in the 1880s. Hinman's young half-sister, Ellen Barnes, came to the mission around 1869.

42 U.S. Census records for the Santee Agency in Nebraska in 1870 (series M595, roll 830, page 196) lists Samuel and Mary Hinman, their three oldest sons (Henry, 7, Samuel, 5, and Robert, 2), as well as Emily West, Mary J. Leigh, and Ellen Barnes. William Ross, 28, a student, also boards with them; his race is given as white. The 1880 census for Eastern Knox County, Nebraska, shows Emily West, farmer, as head of household, with S. D. Hinman as a boarder, along with his sons Henry, Samuel, Robert and William. The two youngest, Thomas and Joseph, had been sent back to Mary Bury Hinman's relatives in Minnesota. Thomas died in 1886 at the age of 14, and Joseph (born in February 1875) was adopted by Mary Bury Hinman's sister in Livingston, Montana. (Mary Hinman St. Croix's oral history)

43 Mary Hinman St. Croix's oral history.

44 H. Bowe of Arnoux, Ritch & Woodford to Hinman, February 25, 1884, in Hinman file, MHS.

45 Hinman v. Hare, testimony of Amos Ross.

46 Mary St. Croix's oral history; other material relating to Hinman's personal situation can be found in U.S. Census reports for Nebraska in 1870 and 1880.

47 Howe, 167; Hinman v. Hare, 675.

48 Howe, 170-71.

49 Hinman to H. B. Whipple, August 19, 1886, Henry B. Whipple Papers, Box 18, MHS. One of Hare's supporters was William Welsh's nephew, Howard Welsh, whom Hinman accused of blocking his attempt to join the Indian service by exerting his influence with the Interior Department. (Hinman to Whipple, August 19, 1886, Whipple papers, Box 18, MHS).

50 U.S. Census, Nebraska, 1880; Hinman v. Hare, p. 40; Hinman to Whipple, August 18, 1886, Whipple papers, Box 18, MHS; Mary La Croix's oral history; Smithsonian Bureau of Ethnology (1879-1965) list of correspondents; New York Times, September 9, 1882.

51 Whipple to Hare, October 21, 1886, Whipple to unknown correspondent, December 23, 1886, and Hinman to Whipple, October 28, 1886, Whipple Papers, Box 18, MHS.

52 Meyer, 280-87.

53 Sheppard, 15, 17-18, 21; Curtis-Wedge, 107; Mary St. Croix's oral history.